STATE OF NEW MEXICO
BEFORE THE SECRETARY OF ENVIRONMENT

IN THE MATTER OF
HEARING DETERMINATION REQUEST
CLASS 3 “EXCAVATION OF A NEW SHAFT
AND ASSOCIATED CONNECTING DRIFTS” Docket No. HWB 21-02
PERMIT MODIFICATION TO THE WIPP
HAZARDOUS WASTE FACILITY PERMIT

ORDER GRANTING IN-PART NMED’S MOTION IN LIMINE
BEFORE THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE is the N.M.

Environment Dept.’s Motion in Limine. After reviewing the argument of
counsel in the motion and reply and the responses and being otherwise fully
advised in the premises, finds as follows:

1. Pursuant to 20.1.4.100(E)(2) and 20.1.4.200(D) NMAC, the Hearing
   Officer has the "authority to take all measures necessary for the
   maintenance of order and for the efficient, fair and impartial
   adjudication of issues arising in proceedings," which includes ruling upon
   motions and admitting or excluding evidence.

2. The Hearing Officer also has the authority and duty to admit all relevant
   evidence unless the evidence is immaterial, unduly prejudicial or
   repetitious, or otherwise unreliable or of little probative value. See
   20.1.4.400(B)(1) NMAC.

3. A motion in limine is a useful tool for controlling the presentation of
   evidence, as it allows the Hearing Officer to prevent immaterial or
   prejudicial matter from encumbering the record. Proper v. Mowry, 90
N.M. 710, 714 (N.M. Ct. App. 1977) Such a motion is a necessary adjunct to the inherent power of the Hearing Officer to assure the fair and impartial administration of justice. See id.

4. "In a permit modification under this section, only those conditions to be modified shall be reopened. All other aspects of the existing permit shall remain in effect for the duration of the unmodified permit."

20.4.1.901(B)(7) NMAC.

5. 20.4.1.900 NMAC incorporates by reference 40 CFR § 270 (permit modification at the request of the permittee). Specific to Class 3 modifications, the “permittee must submit a modification request to the Director that … [e]xplains why the modification is needed.” 40 CFR § 270.42(c)(1)(iii).

6. Furthermore, a certification by the permittee that “the information submitted is, to the best of our knowledge and belief, true, accurate, and complete.” Permit Part 1, Section 1.9; 40 CFR §270.11(d)(1) and §270.30(k)

7. On August 15, 2019, the Permittees submitted a permit modification request (PMR) to modify the hazardous waste facility permit issued by the New Mexico Environment Department (NMED) authorizing the operation of the Waste Isolation Pilot Plant facility in Eddy County, New Mexico.
8. The PMR has been reviewed by the staff of the NMED who, finding the PMR to be administratively and technically complete, have prepared and issued a Draft Permit incorporating the requested changes into the Permit as submitted.

9. In permit hearings, the rules of civil procedure and the technical rules of evidence shall not apply, but the hearings shall be conducted so that all relevant views, arguments, and testimony are amply and fairly received without undue repetition. 20.4.1.901(F)(5) NMAC.

It is therefore based upon any and all of the foregoing,

ORDERED AND ADJUDGED:

A. N.M. Environment Dept.’s Motion in Limine is granted in part, to wit: evidence of future expansion of the Waste Isolation Pilot Plant is not relevant to the approval or denial of the Draft Permit.

B. The Motion in Limine is denied in part, to wit: evidence relevant to why the modification is needed, and the veracity of Permittees’ Certification are relevant to the approval or denial of the Draft Permit.

DONE AND ORDERED in Santa Fe, New Mexico, this 26 day of April 2017.
Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that on April 26, 2021 a copy of the foregoing Order Granting In-Part NMED’S Motion in Limine was emailed to the persons listed below:

Christal Weatherly  
Assistant General Counsel  
New Mexico Environment Department  
121 Tijeras Ave NE, Suite 1000  
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102  
(505) 222-9524

Chris Vigil  
Assistant General Counsel  
New Mexico Environment Department  
121 Tijeras Ave. NE, Ste. 1000  
Albuquerque, NM 87102  
Phone: (505) 383-2060  
Fax: (505) 383-2064  
Email: christopherj.vigil@state.nm.us

Megan McLean  
Environmental Scientist/Specialist  
New Mexico Environment Department  
Hazardous Waste Bureau, WIPP Group  
2905 Rodeo Park Drive East, Bldg 1  
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87505  
(505) 476-6047  
megan.mclean@state.nm.us

Ricardo Maestas  
Hazardous Waste Bureau  
Ricardo.Maestas@state.nm.us

Michael L. Woodward  
Hance Scarborough LLP  
400 West 15th Street, Suite 950  
Austin, TX 78620  
mwoodward@hslawmail.com  
(512) 479-8888

J.D. Head  
Fritz, Byrne, Head & Gilstrap, PLLC  
221 W. 6th St., Suite 960  
Austin, TX 78701  
jhead@fbhg.law  
(512) 476-2020

Robert A. Stranahan, IV  
Law Office of Robert A. Stranahan, IV  
29 A Rancho Mañana  
Santa Fe, NM 87506  
(505) 577-0729  
Rstranahan1@me.com

Dennis N. Cook
General Counsel  
Leslie Brett Babb  
Associate General Counsel  
Nuclear Waste Partnership LLC  
4021 National Parks Highway  
Carlsbad, NM 88220  
dennis.cook@wipp.ws  
Brett.Babb@wipp.ws

George Anastas  
11021 BridgePointe Ct, NE  
Albuquerque, NM 87111  
(505) 797-5452  
GANastas5@Comcast.Net

Scott Kovac  
Nuclear Watch NM  
903 W. Alameda #325  
Santa Fe, NM 87501  
scott@nukewatch.org

Don Hancock  
Southwest Research and Information Center  
PO Box 4524  
Albuquerque, NM 87196-4524  
(505) 262-1862  
sricdon@earthlink.net

Deborah Reade  
505-986-9284  
reade@nets.com

Joni Arends  
Concerned Citizens for Nuclear Safety  
P. O. Box 31147  
Santa Fe, NM 87594-1147  
(505) 986-1973  
jarends@nuclearactive.org

Steve Zappe  
3 Escopeta Ct  
Santa Fe, NM 87506  
(505) 660-0353  
steve_zappe@mac.com

James Angel  
Myles Hall  
Carlsbad Field Office  
U.S. Department of Energy  
P.O. Box 3090  
Carlsbad, NM 88221  
James.Angel@emcbcs.doe.gov  
Myles.Hall@cbfo.doe.gov

Dave McCoy