

STATE OF NEW MEXICO
WATER QUALITY CONTROL COMMISSION

NEW MEXICO ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT,
GROUND WATER QUALITY BUREAU,



Complainant

WQCC 17-08 (A)

v.

**ABEL VILLALPANDO D.B.A. ROCKHILL DAIRY,
ROCKHILL DAIRY, L.L.C.**

Respondent.

**NEW MEXICO ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT'S
PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. The New Mexico Environment Department (“NMED”) is an executive agency within the government of the State of New Mexico and a constituent agency of the New Mexico Water Quality Control Commission (“Commission”). NMSA 1978, §§ 9-7A-4 (1991), 74-6-2(K) (2003).
2. The Ground Water Quality Bureau (“Bureau”) is an organizational unit of NMED within its Water Protection Division created pursuant to the authority granted to the Secretary of the NMED under NMSA 1978, Section 9-7A-6(B)(3) (1991).
3. The Water Quality Act, NMSA 1978, Sections 74-6-1 to -17 (“WQA”) authorizes the Department to issue a compliance order assessing a civil penalty whenever, on the basis of any information, a person is violating a requirement, regulation, or water quality standard adopted pursuant to the WQA. NMSA 1978, § 74-6-10(A)(1) (1993).
4. The Secretary of NMED has every power expressly enumerated in the laws, whether granted to the Secretary, the Department, or any divisions of the Department; the Secretary may delegate authority to subordinates as necessary and appropriate, here the authority to issue administrative compliance orders to the Director of the Water Protection Division. NMSA 1978, § 9-7A-6(B) (1991).
5. Dairy wastewater contains total Kjeldahl nitrogen (“TKN”), consisting of ammonia, nitrogen, and organic nitrogen. Ammonia, nitrogen, and organic nitrogen are water contaminants that have the potential

to alter the physical, chemical, biological, or radiological qualities of water and to adversely affect human health and the environment. Ammonia nitrogen and organic nitrogen from livestock waste readily transform into nitrate as nitrogen (“NO₃-N”) as they pass through the vadose zone and enter ground water. Resulting nitrate concentrations in ground water can exceed the human health standard set forth in Paragraph (9) of Subsection (A) of 20.6.2.3103 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 6; TR 39:25-40:4.

6. Nitrate is a water contaminant that has the potential to alter the physical, chemical, biological, or radiological qualities of water and to adversely affect human health and the environment. The human health standard for nitrate in ground water is 10.0 mg/l. 20.6.2.3103 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 7; Answer and Request for Hearing (“Answer”), p.1, ¶ 7.

7. Mr. Abel Villalpando is the owner of Rockhill Dairy. Answer, p. 1, ¶ 11; NMED Exhibit 3; TR 17:6-18:4.

8. Rockhill Dairy discharges up to 80,000 gallons per day of wastewater as defined by 20.6.6.7 NMAC, and subject to the requirements of the Water Quality Act, NMSA 1978, Section 74-6-1 to -17, 20.6.2 NMAC, and 20.6.6 NMAC, from the production area of Rockhill Dairy. NMED Exhibit 4, p. 3; TR 16:4-10.

9. Rockhill Dairy is located approximately four miles southwest of Dexter, New Mexico within Sections 26 and 27, T13S, R25E, Chaves County. NMED Exhibit 4, p. 3; TR 16:15-18.

10. Ground Water Discharge Permit Number 952 (“DP-952”) was issued to Mr. Villalpando for Rockhill Dairy on September 26, 2005. NMED Exhibit 4, cover letter; TR 35:23-25.

11. DP-952 expired on September 26, 2010. *Id.*

12. The Bureau sent an application reminder letter on December 30, 2011, to Rockhill Dairy. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 18; NMED Exhibit 5; TR 20:8-25.

13. The Bureau received an application for renewal of DP-952 from Rockhill Dairy on March 28, 2012. NMED Exhibit 6; TR 21:12-22:3.

14. The Bureau deemed the renewal application received on March 28, 2012, administratively incomplete because it was submitted on an old application form that would not have included the

information by the then newly-adopted Dairy Rule, 20.6.6 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 20; NMED Exhibit 7; TR 21:13-23:2.

15. The Bureau sent a notice of administrative incompleteness to Mr. Villalpando on April 4, 2012. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 20; NMED Exhibit 7; TR 23:3-23.

16. There is no indication of a response to the Bureau's April 4, 2012 Notice of Administrative Incompleteness in the record. TR 23:24-24:9.

17. The Dairy Rule, 20.6.6 NMAC, became effective on January 31, 2012, providing dairy specific permitting requirements in addition to the ground water permitting requirements of 20.6.2 NMAC. 20.6.6.5 NMAC; TR 25:21-26:11.

18. The Bureau sent a Second Notice of Administrative Incompleteness on July 6, 2012. NMED Exhibit 8; TR 24:11-24.

19. The record does not indicate that Rockhill Dairy responded to either notices of administrative incompleteness. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 21; TR 24:6-25:3.

20. The Bureau sent a Notice of Violation to Rockhill Dairy on October 27, 2012, for failure to submit a complete dairy discharge permit renewal application in accordance with 20.6.6.8 and 20.6.6.10 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 22; NMED Exhibit 9; TR 25:4-20.

21. The Water Quality Control Commission amended 20.6.6 NMAC in June 2015 which revised permitting conditions and requirements for dairy facilities. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 23; TR 26:5-11; *see* 20.6.6 NMAC.

22. On August 1, 2015, the Bureau sent notices to all dairy facilities via first class mail regarding the amendments to 20.6.6 NMAC as well as the timeline requirements for applications pursuant to 20.6.6.35 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 24; TR 25:21-26:19, 28:19-29:18.

23. Nancy McDuffie, the Bureau's Agricultural Program Manager, visited Rockhill Dairy on April 27, 2016, where Ms. McDuffie and Mr. Villalpando discussed the need for Rockhill Dairy to submit a permit application. NMED Exhibit 11; TR 30:10-31:16, 91:15-20.

24. At that time, Ms. McDuffie believed she had secured a verbal agreement from Mr. Villalpando to submit a new permit application within 90 days of the inspection, i.e. by July 25, 2016. NMED Exhibit 11, TR 31:2-10.
25. The Bureau sent an application reminder letter to Rockhill Dairy on June 7, 2016, to memorialize the verbal agreement requirements and to remind Mr. Villalpando that failure to correct the violation would result in formal enforcement action. NMED Exhibit 11; TR 31:5-16.
26. Rockhill Dairy did not submit an application for discharge permit renewal before July 25, 2016. TR 31:17-19, 91:15-23.
27. The Bureau issued a Second Notice of Violation to Rockhill Dairy on July 29, 2016, for failure to submit a completed discharge permit application, and at that time considered Rockhill Dairy to continue to be in non-compliance with the Water Quality Act, 20.6.2 NMAC, and 20.6.6 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 12; TR 31:20-32:20.
28. Rockhill Dairy does not have a standardized system in place to receive and process mail, including certified letters, that are sent to Rockhill Dairy. TR 99:19-100:8.
29. The Department issued Administrative Compliance Order GWQB 17-03 (CO) (“Compliance Order”) to Abel Villalpando dba Rockhill Dairy and Rockhill Dairy LLC on September 22, 2017. NMED Exhibit 2; TR 32:21-23.
30. The Compliance Order required Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy to submit a complete discharge permit renewal application in accordance with 20.6.6.12 NMAC no later than 30 days from the date that the Order becomes final, and that the application be accompanied by the appropriate fees as found in 20.6.2.3114 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 36; TR 37:4-11.
31. Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy received the Compliance Order via certified mail return receipt requested on September 26, 2017, and via FedEx on September 27, 2017. NMED Exhibit 13; TR 36:6-37:3; *see* Respondent’s Answer and Request for Hearing.
32. Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy were in violation of 20.6.2.3104 NMAC by discharging from Rockhill Dairy so that it would move directly or indirectly into groundwater without a discharge permit

since September 26, 2010, when DP-952 expired. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 33; NMED Exhibit 4; TR 34:3-9, 35:3-12.

33. Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy were in violation of 20.6.6.8 and 20.6.6.10 NMAC since January 31, 2012, which was the effective date of 20.6.6 NMAC, by discharging from a dairy facility without a discharge permit. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶ 33; TR 34:9-13.

34. Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy refused to comply with the Water Quality Act and the WQCC regulations, 20.6.2 and 20.6.6 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 2, ¶¶ 30-32; TR 34:13-25.

35. Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy had complete control over the events constituting the violation and chose to disregard several requests to come into compliance. *Id.*; NMED Exhibit 3; NMED Exhibit 15; TR 34:17-25; *see* TR 90:19-2, 94:8-95:2, and 100:24-102:1.

36. The Bureau established a civil penalty policy in 2001 that explains the Bureau's use of discretion in assessing and calculating civil penalties. NMED Exhibit 14; TR 37:17-25.

37. The Bureau properly explained its use of discretion in deciding to assess and in calculating the civil penalty. NMED Ex 15; TR 37:12-43:2.

38. The assessed civil penalty is below the statutory maximum established in NMSA 1978, Section 74-6-10(C)(1). NMED Exhibit 15.

39. Mr. Villalpando did not provide evidence or testimony at the hearing in this matter to refute the violations alleged in the Compliance Order. *See* TR 86:5-115:9.

40. Mr. Villalpando did not provide evidence or testimony at the hearing in this matter that served as a defense to the alleged violations. *See Id.*

41. Mr. Villalpando did not provide evidence or testimony at the hearing in this matter that demonstrates that NMED acted outside its discretion in assessing a civil penalty of \$226,000. *See Id.*; *see also* TR 46:6-17, 111:15-114:9.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

42. Paragraphs 1 through 41 are incorporated herein.
43. The Water Quality Control Commission has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the Compliance Order and the parties to this proceeding and is authorized by the WQA to make a final decision regarding the compliance order based upon the findings of the hearing officer and the evidence presented at the public hearing. NMSA 1978, § 74-6-10(G), (H), and (I).
44. Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy, LLC (“Rockhill Dairy”) are persons as defined in NMSA 1978, Section 74-6-2(I) and 20.6.2.7.JJ NMAC. Answer, p. 1, ref. ¶ 13.
45. No person shall cause or allow effluent to discharge so that it may move directly or indirectly into ground water unless he is discharging pursuant to a discharge permit issued by the Secretary of NMED. 20.6.2.3104 NMAC; Answer, p. 1, ref. ¶ 8.
46. No person shall discharge from a dairy facility without a discharge permit. A person intending to discharge from a dairy facility shall submit an application for a discharge permit. 20.6.6.8 NMAC; Answer, p. 1, ref. ¶ 9.
47. Rockhill Dairy is a facility that meets the definition of a dairy facility as described in 20.6.6.7 NMAC. NMED Exhibit 2; Answer, p. 1 ref. ¶ 12.
48. The discharge of effluent, in the form of dairy wastewater, from Rockhill Dairy is subject to the requirements of the Water Quality Act and the Water Quality Control Commission’s regulations. NMED Exhibit 2; Answer, p. 1, ref. ¶ 15.
49. Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy properly petitioned the WQCC for a public hearing regarding the ACO by filing a request for hearing within 30 days of service of the ACO. 20.1.3.19.A; Answer.
50. The hearing in this matter was properly scheduled to begin no later than 90 days after the request for compliance order hearing, January 9, 2018, but was stayed by agreement of the parties. 20.1.3.19.B NMAC; Public Notice; Order Granting Stay of Hearing.
51. The hearing in this matter was properly noticed on December 8, 2017, for the hearing to begin on January 9, 2018, and was properly renoticed on March 10, 2018, because of the stay of the hearing. Affidavits of Publication.

52. The hearing in this matter was properly held in Santa Fe, New Mexico in Room 307 of the State Capitol Building on Tuesday, May 8, 2018.
53. Ground water beneath the facility is a place of withdrawal for present or reasonably foreseeable future use. *See* NMSA 1978, § 74-6-5(E)(3).
54. The Bureau heard testimony from the Bureau's Agricultural Compliance Section Manager, Nancy McDuffie; the Bureau's Chief, Michelle Hunter; and Mr. Villalpando. *See* TR 11:6, 66:11, and 86:1.
55. Administrative Compliance Order 17-03 (CO) was properly issued by NMED. NMED Exhibit 2.
56. Based on the totality of the evidence in the record, Mr. Villalpando and Rockhill Dairy violated the WQA and the Water Quality Control Commission regulations, specifically 20.6.2.3104 NMAC since September 26, 2010, and 20.6.6.8 and 20.6.6.10 NMAC since January 31, 2012, by discharging from a dairy facility without a properly issued ground water discharge permit.
57. The civil penalties assessed in the Compliance Order were properly calculated within NMED authority and discretion.

Respectfully submitted,

GROUND WATER QUALITY BUREAU
NEW MEXICO ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT

/s/ Christopher N. Atencio

Christopher N. Atencio
Assistant General Counsel
Office of General Counsel
New Mexico Environment Department
121 Tijeras Avenue NE, Suite 1000
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102-3400
Telephone: (505) 222-9554
christopher.atencio@state.nm.us

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing New Mexico Environment Department's Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law was delivered as described below to all parties on June 14, 2018.

Via First-Class U.S. Mail and electronic mail:

Abel Villalpando,
304 East Ojibwa Road
Dexter, NM 88230
starrynightdairy1@yahoo.com
Respondent for Creekside Dairy

Via First-Class U.S. Mail and electronic mail:

Stephen Vigil
New Mexico Attorney General's Office
P.O. Drawer 1508
Santa Fe, NM 87504
svigil@nmag.gov
Counsel for Water Quality Control Commission

Via Hand-Delivery:

Pam Castañeda,
Commission Administrator
P.O. Box 5469
Santa Fe, NM 87502

/s/ Christopher N. Atencio
Christopher N. Atencio