STATE OF NEW MEXICO
BEFORE THE
WATER QUALITY CONTROL COMMISSION

PETITION FOR REVIEW OF THE NEW MEXICO SECRETARY OF THE ENVIRONMENT'S DECISION GRANTING GROUNDWATER DISCHARGE PERMIT DP-1132 IN PROCEEDING GWB17-20(P)

WQCC No. 18-05(A)

ORDER TO VACATE AGENCY DECISION AND REMAND THE PETITION FOR REVIEW OF DP-1132

THIS MATTER came before the New Mexico Water Quality Control Commission ("Commission"), on April 9, 2019 and on May 14, 2019, at the New Mexico State Capitol Building, Room 307, located at 490 Old Santa Fe Trail, in Santa Fe, Santa Fe County, New Mexico, for a ruling on Petitioner's Motion to Vacate Agency Decision and Remand the Petition for Review of DP-1132 ("Motion"), filed on February 4, 2019, by and through Petitioner's counsel, the New Mexico Environmental Law Center (Lindsay A. Lovejoy, Jr. and Jonathan M. Block, Esquires). On June 18, 2019, the Commission, by a unanimous vote in the affirmative, hereby renders this Order to Vacate Agency Decision and Remand the Petition for Review of DP-1132.

The Commission, being sufficiently advised, finds as follows:

1. Petitioner filed its Motion on February 4, 2019.

2. The New Mexico Environment Department filed a Response to the Motion on February 18, 2019.

3. The United States Department of Energy and Triad National Security, LLC as joint permittees under Discharge Permit No. 1132 filed a Response to the Motion on February 19, 2019.

4. The Commission set the Motion for hearing on April 9, 2019.
5. After hearing argument from attorneys for all the parties, on April 9, 2019 the Commission denied the Motion.

6. At the Commission’s May 14, 2019 meeting, the Commission discussed whether to reconsider the April 9 decision, but a motion was approved that the Commission not reconsider the April 9 decision, leaving intact the April 9 denial of the motion to vacate and remand.

7. On June 11, 2019, at the regularly scheduled meeting for the Commission, the Commission voted to vacate the Agency Decision and remand the matter for a new hearing with a newly appointed Hearing Officer.

8. According to Reid v. New Mexico Board of Examiners in Optometry, 1979-NMSC-005, ¶ 7, 92 N.M. 414, 589 P.2d 198 (internal Citations omitted), “At a minimum, a fair and impartial tribunal requires that the trier of fact be disinterested and free from any form of bias or predisposition regarding the outcome of the case. In addition, our system of justice requires that the appearance of complete fairness be present.”

9. The Commission believes that the Hearing Officer’s job application and subsequent hiring by one of the parties created an improper appearance of bias potentially affecting the Secretary’s deliberation and issuance of DP-1132.

10. On June 18, 2019 at a special meeting called by the Commission, the Commission ratified the decision to vacate the Agency Decision and remand the matter for a new hearing with a newly appointed Hearing Officer.

11. At the June 18, 2019 special meeting, John Verheul, Assistant General Counsel for the New Mexico Environment Department made an oral motion to limit the scope of the remand to the Department.

12. The Commission denied Mr. Verheul’s Motion.
IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that pursuant to NMSA 1978, Section 74-6-5(Q), 20.1.3.16(A)(3) NMAC, and 20.1.3.16(F)(3) NMAC the Secretary’s Order is vacated and this matter is remanded to the New Mexico Environment Department for a new hearing with a newly appointed Hearing Officer.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

June 18, 2019

DATE

Jennifer J. Pruett,
Commission Chair
Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing Order to Vacate Agency Decision and Remand the Petition for Review of SP-1132 was emailed to all parties on June 19, 2019. The above-mentioned document can be served via first class mail upon request.

Jennifer Pruett, Esq., Deputy Secretary and Commission Chair
New Mexico Environment Department
1190 St. Francis Drive, Suite N4050
Santa Fe, NM 87505
jennifer.pruett@state.nm.us

John Grubesic
Commission Counsel and Assistant Attorney General
Open Government Division
NM Office of the Attorney General
PO Drawer 1508
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87504
jgrubesic@nmag.gov

Lindsay A. Lovejoy, Jr.
Attorney at Law
3600 Cerrillos Road, Unit 1001A
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87507
lindsay@lindsaylovejoy.com
Counsel for Communities for Clean Water

Johnathan M. Block, Eric D. Jantz,
Douglas Meiklejohn, Jaimie Park
New Mexico Environmental Law Center
1405 Luisa Street, Ste. 5
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87507
jblock@nmelc.org
Counsel for Communities for Clean Water

Mr. Stuart R. Butzier and Ms. Christina C. Sheehan
Modrall Sperling Roehl Harris & Sisk, PA
123 E. Marcy Street, Ste. 201
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501
sbutzier@modrall.com
ccs@modrall.com
Silas R. DeRoma, Site Counsel,
U.S. Department of Energy/NNSA
3734 West Jemez Road/MS-A316
Los Alamos, New Mexico 87544
silas.deroma@nnsa.doe.gov

Ms. Susan L. McMichael
Office of Laboratory Counsel/MS A187
Los Alamos National Laboratory
P.O. Box 1663
Los Alamos, New Mexico 87545-0001
smcmichael@lanl.gov

Counsel for Triad National Security, LLC, and
U.S. Department of Energy/NNSA

Mr. John Verheul, Assistant General Counsel,
New Mexico Environment Department
121 Tijeras Avenue, NE, Suite 1000
Harold Runnels Building, Suite N-4050
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102
john.verheul@state.nm.us
Counsel for the New Mexico Environment Department

Cody Barnes
Commission Administrator
(505) 827-2428
cody.barnes@state.nm.us